



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (Virtual)

Thursday, April 22, 2021

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee. Thanked all for coming together again. He turned the meeting over to Chair and Co-Chair Judge Maynard and Ms. Ajmeri Hoque.

Dwayne Maynard welcomed all to the meeting and thanked all for being a part of the CAC. Dwayne Maynard spoke to the relevance of events that have occurred since last month's meeting. He thanked Rebecca Myers and Becky Metcalf for all the work they do on behalf of the CAC and in preparation for the meeting.

Committee members present: W. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque, Susan Ortega, Imran Malik, Isao Shoji, Stella Villalba, Yanling Yin; Police Department members present: Chief Justin Páez, Lt. Nick Tabernik, Director Jay Somerville, PIO Rebecca Myers, Officer Amber McCloskey, Corporal Devin Howard; Guests: Corporal William Morris, Officer Scott Nichelson, Corporal Jace Dalgord
Minutes by: Becky Metcalf

Committee Business

- **Attendance**

Chief Páez called roll for the meeting:

Judge Dwayne Maynard - present

Ajmeri Hoque – present

Yanling Yin – present

Susan Ortega – present

Imran Malik – present

Isao Shoji – present

Stella Villalba – present

Cortney Ingram – not present

Sri Gaddam – not present

Cameron Justice – not present

- **Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes**

Previously posted amended minutes were reviewed by the committee. Dwayne Maynard asked if everyone had an opportunity to review the amended minutes and if there were any comments or corrections to be made. No responses were received. He asked for a motion to accept the amended minutes from March 2021 as they had been amended. Ajmeri Hoque moved to accept the minutes from the March 2021 meeting as they had been amended. Imran Malik seconded. Dwayne Maynard asked that all in favor of accepting the March 2021 minutes as amended signify by stating "I"; all responses were in favor. Dwayne Maynard asked if anyone opposed; no

responses were received. Amended meeting minutes from the March 18, 2021 CAC meeting were accepted as amended without objection.

Old Business

Dwayne Maynard asked if there was any old business to address. He invited Yanling Yin to offer comments as a follow-up from the last CAC meeting. Yanling Yin shared information about events that have occurred including a rally on March 20 in support of the Asian Community; standing in solidarity against Anti-Asian Hate, where Imran Malik was a speaker. Hundreds of people attended in support from all different races. Additionally, community members participated in the hiring and onboarding process of a DEI Superintendent for Dublin Schools. She commented that there is much work to do but that the CAC can take this crisis and use it as an opportunity to build a stronger community.

Imran Malik provided additional information regarding many more upcoming events occurring all over the State of Ohio: the Asian American Commerce Group, an Asian American community driven business platform, is doing a lot of work to bring systematic racism and social justice issues to light; the Worthington School Board is spearheading some local discussions; there is an event occurring in Dublin in early May focusing on bringing the community together; and a National Day of Prayer coming up on May 6 just to name a few. He also mentioned a vigil that occurred which was organized by Dublin Coffman Progressive students where Ajmeri Hoque was a guest speaker.

Chief Páez conveyed his appreciation for the continued engagement of the CAC members and encourages the CAC to bring those opportunities of engagement to his attention so the department can be there and stand with you in support.

Yanling Yin added that many officers from the Dublin police contacted members of the Asian community personally to ask how they were feeling; she thanked the department for reaching out to the community.

Dwayne Maynard commented that it was good to hear the engagement that has been occurring by the police department and thanked all for sharing all that has been going on over the past month throughout the community.

Chief's Update to Committee

Chief Páez shared presentations from the last CTF meeting with the CAC members; this information was also emailed to all members for review. He asked Isao Shoji to add any additional comments. Isao Shoji provided additional information regarding their discussion about an ordinance that may be presented to Dublin City Council on the LGBTQ+ community and a letter that was submitted to the CTF from a parent whose child is a member of the LGBTQ+ community. He also spoke about the ordinance that is currently being considered in Hilliard and how having an ordinance like this in place can make a difference in someone's life. Ajmeri Hoque asked if that was the anti-discrimination bill that is in front of Hilliard City Council related to housing, work, etc...for members of the LGBTQIA community that is not protected under federal law currently. Isao Shoji confirmed and advised that it will likely come before Dublin City Council and be a very extensive ordinance. Ajmeri Hoque advised there are several cities that have passed similar types of ordinances in Ohio. She asked if we are waiting for Hilliard specifically or if we can use other communities' ordinances as an examples. Isao Shoji advised that they are not specifically waiting

for Hilliard, they just happened to be the most recent community considering an ordinance. Chief Páez thanked Isao for the information on the CTF meeting and asked if there were any other questions. Ajmeri Hoque asked if the demographic numbers were from 2018 or 2019 as the 2020 Census numbers are not yet available. Chief Páez confirmed that is correct.

Chief Páez advised that the Police Section of the City's website, which was updated with the input from the CAC, is up and running and that the department is always open to input and feedback.

Chief Páez advised that the department had its CALEA year three assessment this week encompassing both the Police Department and the Communications Center (NRECC). The assessor's report will be sent forward to CALEA but all indications are that the department is compliant with all standards. In November, the department will undergo its on-site assessment for year four. Dwayne Maynard asked for further information about CALEA. Chief Páez advised that CALEA stands for the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies. It is an international accreditation assessment conducted by an independent third party assessment team. CALEA is a board and commission that establishes best practices and operational standards in the profession. Accreditation is not required for law enforcement agencies but the Dublin Police Department has been accredited for over 30 years. Director Somerville added that there are approximately 447 standards, which encompass many aspects including HR, hiring, operations to name a few, and that a majority of these standards require mandatory compliance.

Chief Páez shared an upcoming "Unity Against Hate Event" which is planned for May 15, 2021 at Coffman Park (tentatively) where event staff, Community Liaison Officers and the department will be partnering with event coordinators. Information will be sent out to CAC members when the event is finalized.

Chief Páez thanked Imran Malik for reaching out and coordinating an opportunity to meet with the leadership of the Ohio CAIR (Council on American Islamic Relations) at their office located in Hilliard. Chief Páez looks forward to future partnerships.

Chief Páez presented highlights about the Northwest Regional Communications Center (NRECC) in honor of National Telecommunicators Week.

Chief Páez deferred to Lt. Tabernik to share Dublin's Policy related to Senate Bill 18 (effective date 4/12/2021) which prohibits restraining or confining pregnant female offenders. Lt. Tabernik presented an overview of Dublin's policy. Ajmeri Hoque asked if the bill specifically refers to obviously pregnant women; how is this policy put into practice. Lt. Tabernik advised the officer would state/ask: "The law requires me to ask you this question upon making an arrest. Are you now, or have you recently been pregnant?" Ajmeri Hoque asked about how this relates to transgender persons who could be pregnant. Lt. Tabernik advised that is definitely something to explore further.

Lt. Tabernik deferred to Corporal Morris to present information on the Community Liaison Officer (CLO) program and the Diversity, Inclusion and Community Outreach Unit. Corporal Morris explained that the policy and purpose of the unit serves to bridge the gap between law enforcement and Dublin's diverse communities by providing relevant resources, training and information to officers and residents. Members of the unit are all full-time Dublin police officers whose involvement is on a voluntary basis. Officer Scott Nichelson and Officer Amber McCloskey

are both part of the unit and present at the meeting. Lt. Tabernik introduced Officer McCloskey and invited her to speak about her role as a CLO.

Officer McCloskey advised many of her roles within the department cross paths. She is a CLO, part of the LGBTQ task force for the City and part of the CAC. She uses her roles to bridge the gap between law enforcement and the community, to build trust, create connections, hear from others about their experiences and learn from their past. She sees all roles as educational for her and hopes they are educational for those she comes in contact with as well.

Officer Nicholson introduced himself and provided information about his role as a CLO. Dwayne Maynard asked Officer Nicholson about how he sees the distinction between his function as an SRO and as a CLO. Officer Nicholson advised that he and Officer Scott Brown were founding members of the CLO program and very thankful for the input and assistance provided by Yanling Yin and Imran Malik in building the program. He was a CLO while working patrol for several years prior to entering the schools as an SRO and that the two roles are distinct but connected as well in that the school district has a very diverse population.

Dwayne Maynard commented about the relationship between the CTF and the CAC. Community outreach and community engagement are the main focus of the CAC. He asked how officers on the front line expand or push the boundaries of involvement particularly with the issues of diversity and inclusion. Officer Nicholson advised that as part of the program he has worked with private entities and other communities that are now trying to mirror Dublin's program. He is always looking for ways to make an impact in the City of Dublin and surrounding communities.

Imran Malik added, from the Islamic community perspective, that the involvement and engagement with the officers builds a level of trust and confidence.

Yanling Yin, on behalf of the Chinese community, thanked Officer Nicholson for his efforts and participation in community events.

Stella Villalba advised how much she enjoys listening to all of the community involvement and emphasized the importance of diversity in language and suggested having interpreters available at upcoming in-person events to reach those community members who do not speak English.

Isao Shoji thanked the CLO's for all they do and asked how they make the decision on when and where to attend events and how the CAC can help to keep them informed of upcoming key events. Corporal Morris advised that we rely heavily on Officers Nicholson and McCloskey to provide information on opportunities for us to engage with the community. The department is open and seeking input from the CAC for opportunities in the areas of training or community engagement and welcomes any thoughts and input.

Officer Nicholson advised that at first they attended events to which they were invited. They reached out to groups initially to let them know what the unit was trying to accomplish. Chief Páez shared his thoughts and offered that officers can attend or support events that are not specifically in the City of Dublin; we can have an impact and support communities outside the City of Dublin. He suggested creating a calendar for upcoming events. Imran Malik asked if the committee should handle the calendar or send information into the office. Rebecca Myers advised

she would be happy to assist with managing the calendar. Officer Nicholson also shared some of the events that were attended prior to the pandemic.

Chief Páez thanked Lt. Tabernik, Officer Nicholson, Corporal Morris, and Officer McCloskey for their input and attendance at the meeting and advised that we will continue to build upon the program and welcome input, recommendations or suggestions to build further connectivity.

Dwayne Maynard asked about the date the CAC needs to submit their report/update to council. Chief Páez indicated the date is to present the report for both the CTF and CAC at the May 10, 2021 council meeting.

Public Commentary

Rebecca Myers advised there were no public comments

New Business

Dwayne Maynard briefly touched on the Beaverton Plan. On April 13th, he, Ajmeri Hoque, Chief Páez, Isao Shoji (who helped facilitate the meeting) and City Manager Dana McDaniel met with leadership of the Community Task Force (chair and vice chair). The CTF recognized that on the issue of public safety, that the CAC could provide valuable input and recommendations on that subject matter. They considered aspirational goals and action items and identified five areas of focus: having a reflective police force; having a culturally responsive public safety staff; community engagement; transparency; and safety for vulnerable communities (identifying what are the vulnerable communities within Dublin). Dwayne Maynard commented that the CAC is already focused on and already considering many of these areas of focus. He asked Ajmeri Hoque if she had anything to add; she did not have anything additional to add. He then thanked Isao for facilitating the conversation and asked if he had anything to add. Isao Shoji had nothing additional to add. Chief Páez advised that the police department would provide the necessary support to facilitate and provide information to the CAC as part of the overall report.

Current Events: George Floyd and Derek Chauvin – 11 months later

Dwayne Maynard offered some time/space for the CAC committee to discuss and share their feelings in the aftermath of the Chauvin trial and new officer involved shootings since the last CAC meeting. He deferred to anyone who wanted to speak on these topics.

Stella Villalba commented from the viewpoint of an educator stating that the work of an educator is to serve their students. She first wanted to honor her life and her family. In the case of Ma'Khia Bryant, she trusted the system and she was failed by the system which includes the educational system as well. Commenting from an educator's point of view, they have been wrestling with this in school, they have held space to have conversations amongst themselves as educators about how are we protecting our children when they believe that we are there to protect them.

Yanling Yin shared her family's experience. They discussed how much force should be used on children, even though a 16 year old is closer to an adult, but is it necessary to use that much force. She asked in general how much force is used or are there guidelines the police force follows?

Ajmeri Hoque shared her feelings, about waiting for the verdict; she was relieved after she heard the verdict; however that did not last long because of the incident with Ma'Khia. She works in the juvenile system handling a lot of cases there, it has been difficult and she has struggled with what to tell the kids who knew her. She watched the video and realizes it was a split-second decision but she also knows that foster families, schools, counselors break up fights with multiple weapons involved and no one dies. This is something she is grappling with because it happened in our community. She was even more horrified about comments made from a CPD officer at the scene. She expressed her concerns about mutual aid agreements where CPD can come into Dublin because the Dublin Police Department culture does not match the CPD culture. She does not feel that is the type of culture in the Dublin Police Department but is genuinely worried about CPD coming into our neighborhoods because we have a very diverse community.

Imran Malik shared his thoughts and feelings about awaiting the verdict; then the loss of life in our community. He commented that it feels like we are taking one step forward and ten steps backward. It makes our task more daunting and difficult but he likes to see the glass half-full. When things like this happen, it exposes our weaknesses but we can convert our weaknesses to strengths. The way forward as a community is moving forward with the momentum of outreach and inclusivity.

Susan Ortega shared her thoughts; she feels we are all still trying to figure out how we all think and feel about everything. Each member of the CAC work in different systems and we have so much ability to change those systems from the inside, which gives her hope. She hopes we can continue to have a society and community that is turned on its side so much that it is ready for change, that people are saying we are done with how things have always been and we want to continue to make them different. She shared that she is originally from Minnesota and spent most of her adult life before coming to Ohio in Minneapolis, in the communities that are now spread across the media regularly. She is cognizant that her personal experience will never be the same of that of her friends, family and colleagues who are people of color and she has tried to reconcile her experience and concerns about her own family who are people of color. She has lots of thoughts and feelings but she does have hope especially about what has been progressing with this committee.

Stella Villalba added how grateful she is for the committee, this work, the conversations and the opportunity to come together. Moving forward, she asks that we keep in mind the lived experiences of our youth and what they are witnessing and seeing in their short years of life. As adults that make decisions that affects children and youth, she requests that we consider what our students, children and youth are witnessing as we move forward and talk about what training, what awareness, and trauma-informed care conversations we need to have because more is added to the "live" experience sadly every week. We need to think about what we need to do moving forward, what systems do we need in place, what training, what conversations we need to have because these are things we can't erase.

Ajmeri Hoque added that the children are experiencing narrative of how they will be perceived if something like that happens. How their worst ten seconds of their life is played out on a body cam video. How the media, how the public will paint them. The dehumanizing things she has been hearing because this child was in foster care, or because this child was attacking someone is horrifying because we have judged her entire life in those ten seconds. She is horrified at how people have reacted to this.

Isao Shoji commented about his struggles, how he is processing this, what he is feeling and what he is trying to express. He would like to look at what is possible, we can't erase what has already happened but we can make sure this doesn't happen again, and certainly not in Dublin. There is a limited influence that we can have on what CPD does or other agencies do but we can talk about what happens here in Dublin. He stated he is thankful we have this forum, where we can come to each other and use this opportunity to understand each other. He wanted to hear the thoughts and feelings that go through an officer's mind, how you would have reacted if you were the first officer at the scene. He advised that is not something he would even pretend to understand because he is not in that role and does not have the experience to draw on but he wants to better understand your side. You have heard a lot about what the citizens are feeling or what we are trying to express but he is interested in hearing the thoughts and feelings from officers that wear the uniform. What are you thinking? What are you feeling? He would like to hear that to better understand and reach something constructive out of this forum to influence what happens in Dublin going forward.

Corporal Howard shared his thoughts. He commented that he too has been thinking and reflecting about this. He has watched the video dozens of times, broken it down frame-by-frame, and asked those same questions about what we would do in that situation and making a decision in a split second. Any loss of life is tragic especially the loss of a juvenile; he feels terrible for the family of Ma'Khia. It is important to remember that a life was also saved on Tuesday and it's important to understand what that victim and her family were going through as a victim of a violent crime. As a police officer using lethal force is something they do not take lightly and is something that, for most officers, will never happen in their career; if it does, it will be a life-changing event. It will affect that police officer, it will affect that person, it will affect other people and the community too; an officer has to consider all of those components in a quarter of a second and it is a very difficult thing to do.

Susan Ortega commented in response. She commented that it is important to remember, as a committee, because officers are put in the position to make those split second decisions; where they have to make that decision in order to preserve life. The work the committee does by building those relationships across the communities does the preventative end of things, building those relationships and doing that preventative work; to say officers aren't just here to be the heavy but they are someone you can reach out to when you need help. That is an extremely important part of this committee, in helping the department have those relationships with the community.

Corporal Howard agreed that prevention is one of the most important things we do, responding to crimes is secondary to preventing situations from happening in the first place. Hearing everyone's opinion, learning about these things, learning about these types of situations, and learning about people in crisis and how to better manage situations with people in crisis ultimately makes us better at preventing these situations. That is the outcome, the ultimate goal, that is what we are trying to do.

Dwayne Maynard commented to the importance of this discussion. It changes his focus; the Chauvin verdict represented a major amount of relief. He has been part of the system; he has been and continues to be a believer in the criminal justice system. The verdict reached by the jury was a reaffirmation for him in the system; in this instance, justice was served. He was

pleased to see that other law enforcement officers, law enforcement professionals came forward and testified that what then Officer Chauvin did was not consistent with training, was not consistent with policy, and in essence was wrong. He was pleased to see civilian witnesses and expert witnesses come forward to speak against the actions of this officer. He was pleased with the jury's verdict in that they did not deliberate for a long period of time; they had paid attention to what had been presented, went back and did their due diligence and rendered a verdict that he felt allowed us a degree of guarded optimism. That maybe we were turning a corner. The type of inhumane treatment that George Floyd encountered was something that our society was not going to tolerate any more. He is thankful for the conversations of this committee and understands there is trauma that officers encounter as well as victims encounter. This led him to consider, in the aftermath of the shooting and death of that young lady, that is something that officer is going to and have to live with for the rest of his life. We have to recognize that a life was saved but also have to recognize that this officer's life is changed. He appreciates the fact that in the CAC's discussions, we can look at many different perspectives and have empathy for all persons involved in situations like the one that happened yesterday.

Chief Páez thanked all for their thoughtful comments. There are times, instances, and occasions where the committee will sit together and have difficult conversations. He is very appreciative and grateful for many reasons for this group, not the least of which is the ability to come together and have open and honest conversation with each other. He offered, as reflection, his absolute gratitude to everyone who is a part of this meeting and who has been a part of these discussions, and that from a personal perspective, how it has helped him grow, and be open, and learn, and empathize in a way that he hopes takes us to a place where we find a future where we can avoid tragic outcomes. In this profession, there really isn't a way to prepare you for all of the things you're going to experience in the course of a career. You can learn from the experience and exposure to events that other officers have had to go through. He also commented that he felt relief in the verdict in the trial, in that the right verdict was reached, and was grateful for the judge, the prosecutor, the witnesses and the jurors for doing what was a very difficult job with the world watching. He is grateful for this group coming together in helping each other, not just the community police relationship, but helping each other as individuals grow from our thoughts, feelings, and perspectives. There is much work to do, you have very willing partners on this end, and he hopes you hear and see that each and every time we come together. He thanked the committee for the opportunity to have this conversation tonight.

Dwayne Maynard thanked the Chief and deferred the presentation on the body worn cameras to the next meeting. He commented that the CAC will continue to do the work and continue to have the hard conversations; when the CAC comes up with their report and recommendations to council, council and the CAC as a group will know that we put in time, offered perspective, and the recommendations we offer are ones that have been thought out and thoroughly discussed. He thanked all of the community partners on the committee.

Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to adjourn. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to adjourn and Imran Malik seconded the motion. All were in favor of adjourning and with that, the meeting was officially adjourned at 7:50 PM.

Body-Worn Cameras Presentation

Deferred to next meeting

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information
614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us